



## Improving Animal Health Service in Pastoral Areas: Regional Dialogue on How to Enhance Public and Private Partnership (PPP) 13-14<sup>th</sup> September 2018, Uganda



Workshop report



# **Improving Animal Health Service in Pastoral Areas: Regional Dialogue on How to Enhance Public and Private Roles**

**13 -14<sup>th</sup> September 2018, Entebbe, Uganda**

## **Background**

The Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) in the Greater Horn of Africa (GHOA) is a Regional organization with the mission to assist and complement the efforts of the member States to achieve, through increased cooperation, food security and environmental protection; promotion and maintenance of peace and security; and, economic cooperation and integration. Between 60-70% of the landmass is arid and semi-arid land (ASAL) where extensive livestock rearing (Pastoralism) is widely practiced. Thus pastoralism and agro-pastoralism are the main source of livelihood support for a great percentage of the human population. However, the livestock sector is constrained by among others transboundary animal diseases (TADs) that contribute to high mortality, low production and productivity, high cost of treatment and prevention and limited access to viable international livestock markets.

Generally, animal health service delivery is the responsibility of the national veterinary services that comprise of the public veterinary authority, private veterinarians and veterinary para-professionals. These have the crucial roles to play in disease control and animal health service delivery either as public or private goods respectively. These players need enabling policy and legal environment for effectiveness and efficiency in their respective roles that can be articulated appropriately through regional dialogue so as to enhance public-private-partnership (PPP) in supply of animal health services.

In 2017, the Regional Pastoral Livestock Resilience Project (RPLRP) brought on board a consultant to IGAD Center for Pastoral Areas and Livestock Development (ICPALD) in order to review policies and practices in the member States on the roles of private and public sectors in supply and provision of animal health services and developed a Framework for the IGAD region. The report highlighted some key achievements and challenges and proposed recommendations for follow up and implementation by the stakeholders at different levels. Thus effective prevention and control of livestock diseases can and will be achieved by close collaboration between private and public animal health service providers. The report also highlighted that overall delivery of animal health services and access to affordable and effective livestock health products including veterinary drugs and vaccines remains a major challenge for pastoralists. Among others, lack of clear policy and legal support for public-private partnership; inadequate database and information management systems are identified as gaps.



The regional framework enumerated a number of gaps that include under-resourced public sector; weak private sector; weak public-private partnerships; weak institutional linkages; legal and policy gaps; inadequate information management systems and poor preparedness to handle livestock related emergencies; weak implementation of policies, legislations and regulations and low compliance by stakeholders; inadequate regional harmonization of animal health policies and sanitary standards and weak regulatory framework for veterinary drugs, feeds & biologicals, food safety, animal welfare, animal identification, registration and traceability.

A two-day regional dialogue on public-private partnership (PPP) is planned to further discuss on the findings of the review, develop roadmap how to manage the enumerated gaps among others between the public and private sectors in the member States. Proposed participants will be drawn from the public (epidemiology, laboratory, disease and pest control divisions), regulatory bodies (veterinary boards), veterinary associations and private sectors (veterinary and para-veterinary practitioners, agro-vet outlets).

### **1. Workshop objectives**

- Present and discuss how to rollout the recommendation and lessons on the private-public-partnership (PPP) study and IGAD framework on at national levels of Ethiopia, Kenya and Uganda;
- Discus and review the status of animal health service delivery in pastoral areas highlighting successes, gaps and explore way forward for strengthened collaboration;
- Review information sharing modalities between the public and private sectors both vertically and horizontally so as to enhance information flow in order to spur public private partnership engagement; and
- Discuss the contribution of community animal health worker (CAHW) and how to improve (harmonize) training curriculum, provide support and monitor their actions.

### **2. Expected output**

- Status and how to rollout the recommendation of the IGAD study on PPP and regional framework at national level agreed upon;
- Way forward agreed on linkages between the public and private sectors strengthened, and Information sharing modalities agreed upon between private and public sector; and
- Clear action agreed on how to support and strengthen CAHWs services through training, certification and follow up.

### **Proceeding**

Dr. Anna Rose Ademun Okurut, the Chief Veterinary Officer, Uganda officially opened the workshop. She highlighted that loan schemes in agriculture has faced serious challenges because



of unfavorable weather patterns like drought that decimate crops and contribute to high livestock mortality. More effort is required from the livestock sector to attract private sector investors into potential areas like export slaughterhouses, quarantine facilities, vaccine production & marketing among others.

In his welcome remark, Dr. Solomon Munyua, ICPALD Director highlighted the high indebtedness the African continent is getting into after borrowing heavily from China such that some countries have ceded management of important national infrastructures like airports, sea ports, oil fields, etc to China for management until full recovery of loans. Africa is not the only continent since Maldives, Sri Lanka and even Pakistan are facing the same challenges of heavy debts with China. The way out of this stalemate is to embrace public private partnership for development of some infrastructure whereby the private sector is allowed to develop the facility and manage for a period of 30 years or so according to the national laws to recoup its investment capital and hand back to the government after the agreed period. In the livestock sector, private sector investment can be in animal genetics, animal feed manufacturing and fodder seed production and marketing, local and export slaughterhouses, tanneries, leather finishing, quarantine stations, livestock transport, vaccine production and marketing, laboratory inputs and services, animal health, livestock markets and holding grounds among others. The meeting was attended by 25 participants from Ministries responsible for Livestock, Finance (PPP Unit), veterinary boards, OIE, VSF-G, vaccine production units and private veterinarians from IGAD member states (annex 1)

## **Presentations**

Key policy gaps and proposed framework on Roles of Private and Public Sector in Supply and Provision of Animal Health Services in the IGAD region; lessons and recommendations

## **Plenary discussion**

- It is important to differentiate between PPP and public - private sector investment in order to guide attraction for investment after undertaking private sector analysis to inform the target areas in the livestock sector as mentioned in the welcome remarks.
- For PPP to be attractive to potential partners, it must be underpinned by a credible PPP policy guidelines and legal framework to attract private sector investment

## **Country presentations**

- Animal health delivery services by the public and private sectors-with a focus to pastoral areas: progress, challenges and recommendations
- Success and challenges in implementation of PPP in the delivery of animal health services

## **Plenary discussion**

- Many community animal health workers (CAHWs) trained drop out of offering animal health service because projects supporting their trainings end, inadequate demand for services or poor payment by pastoralists and inaccessibility to veterinary drugs once the supporting projects phase out



- It is a big challenge to monitor and control the CAHWs because of high mobility of livestock in ASALs, the vast areas of operation with poor road network and thin capacity of regulatory bodies in the ASALs. However, trainers (NGOs) of CAHWs in South Sudan are regulated by the government with regulated training curriculum and institute where training is undertaken. CAHWs are also continuously trained and monitored in Ethiopia to ensure adequate service delivery
- Veterinary Service Development Fund was introduced in Kenya under Ministry of livestock in 1996 to support the service delivery and needs of veterinary service. This was to take care of low financial disbursement from the Ministry of Finance. Funds were raised from meat inspection, vaccinations, hides and skins, sale of property among others. The fund was to run few services- vehicles, lab equipment, inspection equipment etc
- K-Lift fund in Kenya was introduced in 1994 to support livestock sector investors obtain loans so as to alleviate poverty. Qualifications to obtain loans included animal health service providers, drug/ chemical store operators (agrovet operators), start livestock farms, dealers in livestock products, animal feed manufacturers, fish operators among others.
- Kenya veterinary board initiated acquisition of continuous professional development (CPD) points by all veterinary surgeons and para professionals to ensure regular professional updates for efficient animal health service delivery. The board has taken over 1,000 non-compliant practitioners to court to ensure compliance to laid down regulations governing animal health service delivery.
- Veterinary interns in Kenya have been posted to ASAL counties to enhance animal health service delivery as a way to counter the use of CAHWs or community disease reporters (CDR). If this works out well, use of CDR will naturally phase out in ASALs.

## **Day 2:**

### **Status of Vaccine production and marketing in the country- NVI, KEVEVAPI and vaccine unit in Uganda**

#### **Plenary discussion**

- The proposed tick vaccine to control at least three tick species especially Rhipicephalus, Boophilus and Amblyomma in Uganda is being mooted for tick control in Uganda with the support of Cuba researchers. Ticks have become a menace and a big thread to livestock due to tick resistance to available acaricides in the country
- Vaccine production in Kenya and Ethiopia is demand driven. The uptake is high during disease emergencies. Free vaccine supply and subsidies by NGOs and governments have given unfair competition to private sector operators phasing them out of business. There is need to lay proper regulatory strategies to regulate vaccine supply such that private sector operators are given opportunity to procure vaccines for NGOs
- Vaccine marketing is done by the agents recruited in various parts of the countries in the form of public and private sector engagement. The vaccine institutes also lobby for more budget allocations from the national/ federal governments while at the same time, in Kenya, KEVEVAPI has signed memoranda of understanding with the 47 counties on modalities of



how to supply vaccines and modes of payment. National government in Kenya only complements county efforts in control of TADs during outbreaks that threaten international cross border as contained in the developed bilateral and multilateral MoUs otherwise, routine vaccination programmes remain the functions of the county governments.

### **Group discussion points**

#### **Key areas of potential PPP investment in the livestock sector**

- Vaccine production and supply
- Disease control/ management (say on service contract)
- Control of food borne diseases/ food safety
- Animal breeding/Genetic resources
- Quarantine stations
- Local and export slaughter houses
- Development of Training centers/institution for animal health service providers(middle level)
- Laboratory and Diagnostic services lab
- Livestock Identification and Traceability System (LITS)

#### **Processes to establish and or strengthen PPP in the livestock sector**

Each country should have the following to establish and implement PPP

- Policy
- Act
- Regulations
- Guidelines (Specific guidelines for the livestock sector)
- PPP team or structure in the livestock sector
- Capacity building programs of government staff in the livestock sector on establishment and strengthening of PPP
- Provision of both financial and technical resources for preparation of PPP projects e.g from, oie, World Bank, IGAD, GALVmed Africa and Asia
- Sensitize stakeholders on PPP
- Learning exchange programs for successful countries





## **Recommendations and Way forward:**

1. Member States are encouraged to rollout the proposed actions on the validated roles of public and private sectors and framework in the supply and provision of animal health services in the IGAD region
2. Member States should encourage private sector investment in disease prevention and control through surveillance, vaccinations and laboratory diagnostics
3. IGAD to support member states where there is need to develop/ review/ strengthen PPP policy and legislative framework to guide animal health delivery initiatives.
4. Member states should identify potential PPP projects under the livestock sector for private sector investment such as vaccine production and supply, disease control/ management, control of food borne diseases/ food safety, animal breeding/Genetic resources, Quarantine stations, Local and export slaughter houses, Training centers/institution for animal health service providers(middle level), Laboratory and Diagnostic services lab and LITS among others among others
5. Ministries responsible for livestock should develop bankable projects that can attract more budget allocation from national / federal governments and development partners to undertake PPP identified projects
6. IGAD should collaborate with PPP trainers such as Macroeconomic and Financial Management Institute (MEFMI) of Eastern and Southern Africa, Zimbabwe to build the capacity of livestock sector country teams on PPP
7. Ministries responsible for Livestock should work closely with their country PPP units in Ministries responsible for finance to push through potential PPP projects
8. IGAD should convene a follow up annual regional meeting to review the progress realized by MS in uptake and implementation of PPP viable initiatives after the Entebbe meeting
9. MS should develop clear animal health service delivery strategies to regulate free and or subsidized vaccination programmes to avoid market distortion and unfair competition with private sector investors
10. IGAD should lobby MS to restore chain of command on good governance of veterinary services using PVS guidelines for efficient service delivery
11. IGAD should lobby MS to allow control of TADS be national/ central/ federal government mandate

**NB:** MEFMI- Macroeconomic and Financial Management Institute of Eastern and Southern Africa, Zimbabwe



## Annex 1: List of Participant

South Sudan	Dr Jacob M. Korok Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries Director General Veterinary Services +211923848848 <a href="mailto:jacobkorok@yahoo.co.ke">jacobkorok@yahoo.co.ke</a>	Silvester Okoth VSF Germany <a href="mailto:Silvester.Okoth@vsfg.org">Silvester.Okoth@vsfg.org</a>
Kenya	Dr. Indraph Mugambi Ragwa Kenya Veterinary Board Chief Executive Officer +254721848145 <a href="mailto:irmugambi@yahoo.com">irmugambi@yahoo.com</a>	Dr. Jane Wachira KEVEVAPI CEO +254722784748 <a href="mailto:Jane.wachira@kevevapi.org">Jane.wachira@kevevapi.org</a>
	Thomas Daido Dulu OIE Programme Officer +254721276508 <a href="mailto:t.dulu@oie.int">t.dulu@oie.int</a>	Dr. Michael K. Cheruiyot State Department of Livestock /DVS Senior Deputy DVS +254720306557 <a href="mailto:drmkcheruiyot@gmail.com">drmkcheruiyot@gmail.com</a>
	Dr. Hesbon Awando State Department of Livestock DFZ Programme +254722312130 <a href="mailto:ahesbon@gmail.com">ahesbon@gmail.com</a>	Dr. George Njogu SDL/DVS SADVS / Epidemiologist +245722540667 Njorogen2003@yahoo.com
	Wycliffe Ondieki PPP Unit National Treasury, Monitoring and Evaluation Specialist +254721229563 <a href="mailto:Wycliffe.ondieki@gmail.com">Wycliffe.ondieki@gmail.com</a> , <a href="mailto:wondieki@piv.go.ke">wondieki@piv.go.ke</a>	Dr. Charles Toroitich Kisa RPLRP Kenya Livestock Health Expert +254705173138 <a href="mailto:tembutoro@gmail.com">tembutoro@gmail.com</a>
Ethiopia	Abebe Tadesse Feyis Ministry of Finance and Economic Cooperation Director , PPP Projects , Vet and Monitoring +251911309377 <a href="mailto:abebe@ymail.com">abebe@ymail.com</a>	Kassaw Amsaw Tadesse Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock Epidemiologist +251912024336 <a href="mailto:Kassua512@gmail.com">Kassua512@gmail.com</a>
	Dr. Bewket Siraw Adgeh Tufts University Senior Livestock Research and Development Advisor ,AKLDP- Tufts +251935353876 <a href="mailto:Besiad123@gmail.com">Besiad123@gmail.com</a>	Martha Yemi Feyissa National Veterinary Institute Director +251191510894 <a href="mailto:marthayami@yahoo.com">marthayami@yahoo.com</a>
Somalia	Mustaf Ibrahim Adan MOLFR – Somalia EDMU Officer/ Acting CVO +252615912561	





	<a href="mailto:mustafvet@gmail.com">mustafvet@gmail.com</a>	
Uganda	Dr. Michael Kaziro Amudat District Local Government Senior Veterinary Officer +256782529503 <a href="mailto:drkaziro@gmail.com">drkaziro@gmail.com</a>	Dr. Baluka Silvia Uganda Veterinary Association President +256775043052 <a href="mailto:sbaluka3@gmail.com">sbaluka3@gmail.com</a>
	Kimaanga Michael Ministry of Agriculture Animal Industries and Fisheries Senior Veterinary Inspector +256782244906 <a href="mailto:mkimanga@yahoo.com">mkimanga@yahoo.com</a>	Dr. Anna Rose Ademun Okurut Ministry of Agriculture Animal Industry and Fisheries Acting Commissioner Animal Health /Chief Veterinary Officer +256772504746 <a href="mailto:ademunrose@yahoo.com">ademunrose@yahoo.com</a>
	Dr. Nakanjako Maria Flavia Ministry of Agriculture Animal Industry and Fisheries Veterinary Inspector +2547738088238 <a href="mailto:mfrakanyako@gmail.com">mfrakanyako@gmail.com</a>	
Sudan	Khidir Mohamed Elfaki Ministry of Animal Resources DG Animal Health +249912133652 <a href="mailto:Khidirfaki59@hotmail.com">Khidirfaki59@hotmail.com</a>	
ICPALD	Dr. Solomon Munyua Director +254721696965 <a href="mailto:Muchina.munyua@igad.int">Muchina.munyua@igad.int</a>	Dr. Ameha Sebsibe Head Livestock and Fisheries +254721233045 <a href="mailto:Ameha.sebsibe@igad.int">Ameha.sebsibe@igad.int</a>
	Dr. Dereje T. Wakjira Coordinator RPLRP +254726173628 <a href="mailto:Dereje.wakjira@igad.int">Dereje.wakjira@igad.int</a>	Dr. Wamalwa Kinyanjui Animal Health Expert +245722887723 <a href="mailto:Wamalwa.kinyanjui@igad.int">Wamalwa.kinyanjui@igad.int</a>
	Mequanent Tadesse RPLRP Project Accountant +254700114169 <a href="mailto:mequanent.wondie@igad.int">mequanent.wondie@igad.int</a>	Rose Tsuma rose.tsuma@igad.int

